

BRITISH BROADCASTING CORPORATION

RADIO 4

TRANSCRIPT OF "FILE ON 4"- 'MINING IN SOUTH AFRICA'

CURRENT AFFAIRS GROUP

TRANSMISSION: Tuesday 25th March 2008 2000 - 2040

REPEAT: Sunday 30th March 2008 1700 - 1740

REPORTER: Angus Stickler

PRODUCER: Andy Denwood

EDITOR: David Ross

PROGRAMME NUMBER: 08VQ3939LHO

THE ATTACHED TRANSCRIPT WAS TYPED FROM A RECORDING AND NOT COPIED FROM AN ORIGINAL SCRIPT. BECAUSE OF THE RISK OF MISHEARING AND THE DIFFICULTY IN SOME CASES OF IDENTIFYING INDIVIDUAL SPEAKERS, THE BBC CANNOT VOUCH FOR ITS COMPLETE ACCURACY.

“FILE ON 4”

Transmission: Tuesday 25th March 2008

Repeat: Sunday 30th March 2008

Producer: Andy Denwood

Reporter: Angus Stickler

Editor: David Ross

ACTUALITY OF BLAST

STICKLER: Blasting at a platinum mine in South Africa. It's run by Anglo American, a UK based corporate giant - a company that courts prime ministers and presidents, keen to promote itself as leading the way with corporate responsibility. But as global demand increases for platinum, we look at its record in South Africa. Amid a spate of deaths at the rock face, and with thousands of people forced from tribal lands, we ask: what is the true price of platinum?

SIGNATURE TUNE

ACTUALITY OUTSIDE ANGLO AMERICAN

This is 44 to 45 Main Street, Johannesburg – the South African offices of Anglo American, the third largest mining operation in the world. Next to stained glass windows, sandstone eagles guard the entrance of this building. It resembles something between a cathedral and a bank. The company made its fortune from gold, but now the price of platinum has doubled – and business is booming.

DE HOOP: The problem we face at the moment is we need to dig more platinum out of the ground and we can't do it fast enough.

STICKLER: Henk de Hoop of the Rand Merchant Bank is an expert on the platinum market. For decades it was a precious metal used mainly for jewellery. But then a new market opened up: a greener, cleaner car industry.

DE HOOP: Where the real boom came in was in 1973, when the US legislation came in which forced a lot of the car manufacturers to start using catalysts. At the moment well over 90% of global cars newly produced will have to have a catalyst fitted. In Europe a lot of people started liking diesel cars. Now diesel have particular catalyst demands which force them to use quite a bit of platinum. As the legislators start cleaning up the combustion engine fleet, trucks, bull-dozers, tractors, cranes will have catalysts as well. So the outlook for platinum from that perspective is fantastic.

STICKLER: So the global drive for clean air is pushing the market?

DE HOOP: That's it. And whatever way you look at it, we have got a boom in demand coming and it's just hoping that we get enough out of the ground to supply that big boom coming up.

STICKLER: Southern Africa holds nearly 90% of the world's platinum reserves. Anglo American's corporate brochures give some sense of the scale of engineering involved – it is now the world's largest producer of the precious metal. And amid the boasts over productivity and profit, it also makes great play of its corporate environmental and social responsibility. Anglo American chairman, Sir Mark Moody Stuart, played a significant role in Tony Blair's Africa Commission - the company is part of the UN Global Compact. Edward Bickham is Anglo American's Group Head of External Affairs.

BICKHAM: Anglo American is already contributing over \$1 billion a year to the South African Exchequer – probably in the region of 2.5% of total tax paid, so that is making a significant contribution to the economy. And then, if you actually look at expenditure with the suppliers, Anglo American is probably spending something in the

BICKHAM cont: region of \$16 billion a year with suppliers in the country, so in terms of the contribution that's happening to the economy and its ability therefore to get people out of poverty, that's very significant.

ACTUALITY IN RUSTENBURG

STICKLER: This is Rustenburg, said to be the fastest growing city in South Africa, and that's due to the current platinum rush. It's about two hours drive from the capital, Pretoria, and Anglo American's operations here – under the auspices of its subsidiary, Anglo Platinum - are vast. Huge tracts of land – mile after mile - are taken up by mines, smelters and refineries. It employs around eighty thousand workers. But there is a human cost. In total, in 2007, twenty-five miners were killed: buried alive in mud slides, caught in machinery, blasts – even drowned.

NTLHE: He was struggling to get out, but who will help you when you are inside the water in a box? I can't imagine it. I can't imagine it.

STICKLER: Jack Ntlhe is still in shock. Two months ago his adoptive brother, Seelo, was killed in the Amandelbult mine near Rustenburg. Following a period of heavy rain, a main shaft flooded hundreds of metres underground. On the 28th January, while carrying out maintenance work in the pit, Seelo entered the lift cage. He was lowered down the shaft. The lift didn't stop and he was trapped under water.

NTLHE: To be trapped in the water is the worst thing that can ever happen to any person because you see yourself and you see what is happening to yourself, and you can't help yourself. This was my little brother, yes. This was my little brother.

STICKLER: Submerged, locked in the cage, he drowned. His arms, we are told, were battered and bruised where he had tried to set himself free. Seelo was just 23 years old when he died. He was the family's main breadwinner. His mother, Martha, must now cope with the grief and the battle to feed her retired husband, daughter and grand-daughter.

MARTHA [VIA INTERPRETER]: People from the mine came here on the day he died and they told us that Seelo has fell in the water in the mine.

STICKLER: Did they tell you how he died?

MARTHA [VIA INTERPRETER]: On that day they just said he fell in the water at the mine. I feel very sad because this was a very good son for me and I love him very much. I can't afford to lose such a son. We are going to suffering because now he is dead.

STICKLER: You're going to suffer because he's dead?

MARTHA: Mmm, mmm. [VIA INTERPRETER] It doesn't matter what the mine can try to do or say or offer. There's no amount of money that can replace my son.

ACTUALITY AT MINE

STICKLER: The gates of the Amandelbult mine where Seelo lost his life. To the left, a huge waste heap, and towering over us to the right, the winding gear that lowers miners to the rock face. According to William Mataboge, regional Health and Safety Chairperson of the Rustenburg National Union of Mineworkers, the union requested extra safety measures – trip switches and a physical barrier to be put across the shaft to stop the cage being lowered too far.

MATABOGUE: We said to management, how best can we barricade the place so that nothing can go beyond that place? The management indicated that they have issued a special instruction and everybody is aware that there is a flood and nothing can happen. And unfortunately the incident happened.

STICKLER: And you categorically state that the NUM asked them to put a barrier across that shaft?

MATABOGUE: Yes, we said to management, at least something must be in place, so that if maybe something can happen, we know that there is an alternate preventative measure.

STICKLER: And this was prior to the accident? You asked them to do that prior to the accident?

MATABOGUE: Yes, immediately after the flooding was reported.

STICKLER: And they refused?

MATABOGUE: Yes.

STICKLER: On average, over the past decade, nearly twenty workers were killed in Anglo Platinum's mines in South Africa every year. In the first half of last year eighteen died – five in the space of one two-week period. The company suspended operations at one of its mines for seven days. Speaking at the Anglo American Annual General Meeting last year, the newly appointed Chief Executive, Cynthia Carroll, described the current situation as unacceptable and said: "We will be relentless in working to improve our safety performance". Mary-Jane Morifi is Executive Head of Corporate Affairs for Anglo Platinum.

MORIFI: Clearly this is not acceptable, because we feel that one death is one death too many, which is why the company, Anglo Platinum has got an Enhanced Safety Improvement Plan that it is trying to make sure that all of our miners understand what the processes are, to ensure that the values of our employees are aligned with the values of Anglo Platinum, one of which is around safety.

STICKLER: There is a problem there though, isn't it, because this has been going on for some time, year on year around twenty people are killed.

MORIFI: People get killed every year and, as I said, it is not acceptable. We strive for continuous improvement and hence the whole focus of Anglo Platinum and Anglo American on safe working environments.

STICKLER: In January of this year you had a tragic fatal accident where a young man was lowered in a cage into a flooded mine.

MORIFI: It was a very tragic accident; an accident that should not have happened.

STICKLER: The NUM say they asked for trip switches, barriers to be installed at that mine to prevent an accident like this happening.

MORIFI: I am not able to give details as to what happened there until such time that we have the official report issued.

STICKLER: Will the family be compensated in any way?

MORIFI: Anglo Platinum regrets loss of life. We will, as I said, after the investigation, engage with the family to understand how we go forward with them from here.

ACTUALITY OF RUBBLE

STICKLER: With the platinum rush, new concessions are opening up in South Africa. Anglo Platinum has historically played a canny game. In the early 1990s, in the dying days of white rule, it signed lease agreements with tribal leaders, acquiring their ancestral homelands for as little as 50 cents – that’s about four pence per hectare. And in these new areas the technology has changed. Rather than deep pit mining, massive open cast mines are coming on stream. And to make way, thousands of people - villagers – have been forced from their ancestral lands. They’ve been “relocated” to purpose built townships financed by the mine, offered compensation and new land. The mine says that it has provided better housing and that now the vast majority of villagers are better off. But not everyone is happy to go.

ACTUALITY OF FARM ANIMALS

STICKLER: This is what’s left of the village of Ga-Pila, a one-time thriving farming community. Now, amid the rubble of demolished, abandoned houses, we’re told around 140 people are holding out. Abel Moholah, a pensioner, gives me a tour and describes how life was before the mine came.

MOHOLAH: This land is rich, it's a rich soil. This land is rich with plants. You seen mealies, pumpkins, beans, everything, everything, sugar canes. We eat enough in our fields here, we eat enough.

STICKLER: And we're now walking along part of the razor wire topped fence put up by the mine.

MOHOLAH: Yes, this belongs to the mine.

STICKLER: How long have your family lived here – your forefathers?

MOHOLAH: Because my father was born here, his father was also born here. When the Boers came here they found our forefathers here, they fought for this place. The First World War, my father went there, as far as Germany, as far as Europe. Second World War he went also, 1939. He's buried here. His forefathers are also buried here. It makes us angry. This is our ancestors' place. That's why we can't leave this place. Apartheid is not over.

STICKLER: Rose Thlarera is 65. She says it's not about money – this is their land.

THLARERA: I worked my arse off working for these people, for white people, and cleaning their houses. I'm not going to move because they just come and tell me, force me to go. I can't do that. I believe I have also got rights, like a human being. What the mine is doing to us is worse than the Apartheid era.

STICKLER: You firmly believe that?

THLARERA: During the Apartheid era, we had our water and electricity, but we didn't have the mine amongst us. I mean, Anglo Platinum has buried us alive.

STICKLER: What was wrong with you?

MOHOLAH: I was suffering inside my stomach.

STICKLER: In your stomach, pains in your stomach?

MOHOLAH: Yes.

STICKLER: And what did they say was wrong with your stomach?

MOHOLAH: They didn't tell me what was the cause of that, which caused me the trouble in my stomach, they didn't tell me the cause, of course. It stops me not to get enough to breathe, I didn't have enough air to breathe.

STICKLER: Do you think that your complaint was caused by the poor water here?

MOHOLAH: Maybe, I'm not sure so I just say maybe.

STICKLER: Have many people in the village – those that are left in the village – have many people fallen ill?

MOHOLAH: Yes.

STICKLER: After drinking the water?

MOHOLAH: Yes. [COUGHS]

STICKLER: The remaining community in Ga-Pila is right to be concerned about this water. In October last year the charity Action Aid commissioned independent analysis of water sources close to Anglo Platinum mines. A sample taken at the seep at Ga-Pila found it to be unfit for human consumption. The water contained high concentrations of salts, in particular nitrates: this can cause stomach cancer and a sometimes fatal blood disorder – one of the symptoms of which is shortness of breath.

ACTUALITY WITH CARIN BOSMAN

STICKLER: In the leafy suburbs of Pretoria we met up with Carin Bosman, the independent environmental chemist who conducted the water analysis. She took samples across ten different sites in the Limpopo Province, including Ga-Pila.

BOSMAN: The people at Ga-Pila village, who uses water that comes from a river that emanates from the mining property, so from the samples that we took we found some that raised serious concern in terms of the safety or the supply as drinking water sources.

STICKLER: Fit for human consumption?

BOSMAN: No, definitely not.

STICKLER: The sites included another village in the same area, Ga-Molekane. Water sources for the whole community – including the primary and secondary schools - were tested. There has been no resettlement here. However the village sits adjacent to Anglo Platinum's Potgietersrus mine, next to a reservoir of waste known as the slimes dam.

BOSMAN: The water supply at the Ga-Molekane village, the secondary school and the community, has got extremely high levels of nitrates and bacteriological contamination. The water supply at the primary school, extremely high levels of nitrates, which according to South African water quality guidelines far exceeds safe levels and especially is of concern when water of that kind of quality is provided to children in their developmental years.

STICKLER: You went through a process of elimination to see where the problem may lie, in terms of those high nitrates, what were your findings?

BOSMAN: Nitrates is something that does not naturally occur in the environment. It's normally found where you get human or animal excrement, or fertilizer use, or use of explosives, ammonia-based explosives. At the primary school the

STICKLER: Without wanting to seem to be alarmist, it would appear that from here, from what's written here, that high nitrates and salts can cause a blood disorder, a blood disease and the symptoms of that, in some cases, is shortness of breath, mental status changes, headache, fatigue, exercise intolerance, dizziness and a loss of consciousness. In severe cases, it says here, and there it is underlined – seizures, coma and death.

LEKOANE: Shooo! This is terrible, our lives are at stake. This is deadly. Do you mean the whole community of Molekane, because we are having 730 children here and we are all drinking this water.

STICKLER: Does anyone come and test your water regularly?

LEKOANE: No. If we are thirsty we have to drink. We can only drink what is available.

ACTUALITY ON DIRT TRACK

STICKLER: Well we've just driven around the corner on the dirt track roads here and we're just coming up to the local secondary school, and on the big white sign in front of me here, there is the Anglo Platinum logo – and underneath it says "Supported by Potgietersrus Platinums Limited." So we're now going to go and try and talk to the head teacher here to see what the situation is with the water and what the mine actually does for the school and the children here.

ACTUALITY AT SECONDARY SCHOOL

STICKLER: We were taken into the office of the principal, Kenneth Chepape. He told us how Anglo Platinum had provided the school with fencing, a pit toilet and a water tank supplied by a borehole. The same water tested by Carin Bosman. We showed him the sampling results.

CHEPAPE: I'm shocked to hear this. We don't have the resources of testing the water ourselves. And I don't even know what to say.

STICKLER: Has anyone at the school ever fallen ill?

CHEPAPE: The complaints, the regular complaints that we get from the learners are the headache and running stomach. We do have at times some learners complaining of dizziness, but we did not think that it could be connected to perhaps the contamination of water. Yes, you see I'm shocked to hear this story. I don't even know whether to let them continue drinking water or not.

STICKLER: I mean, just reading on here it would appear that it can have longer term effects, in that nitrates can lead to especially stomach cancer. That's what it reads here.

CHEPAPE: Oh yeah, so this needs immediate attention.

STICKLER: Anglo Platinum have helped with building toilets, have helped with putting up a water tank?

CHEPAPE: I don't think, personally I don't think it is enough. Because it is an open secret that they are making millions and millions out of the land that was formerly occupied by the community.

STICKLER: Mary-Jane Morifi, Anglo Platinum's Executive Head of Corporate Affairs, defends the mine's position.

A sample taking at the seep at Ga Pila found water to be unfit for human consumption. It found high concentrations of salt, sulphur and nitrate. The cause, this analysis says, is the mine, mining activities.

MORIFI: I would be surprised because Ga Pila is upstream from our mining activity in and around that area.

STICKLER: The other sites include Ga Molekane, the primary school there, the secondary school. And according to this analysis the water has been contaminated again by your mine.

MORIFI: Again, I will have to see whether, what the results say. I am not able to sit here and say, yes it is the mine, or no it is not the mine. We would be interested in engaging with Action Aid to understand the results and where exactly they tested. Anglo Platinum was asked by the Department of Education to come and drill a borehole at the school.

STICKLER: And it's water from that borehole that is unfit for human consumption, contaminated by your mine.

MORIFI: I don't know whether it is contaminated by the mine or not, and whether it is contaminated. Until such time that we see the results, then can we make the judgment. But to say that because Anglo Platinum dug this borehole at the request of the Department of Education, because they saw a need to provide school kids with water, and therefore we need to be blamed for it, I think that is unfair. It was done seven years ago under the assumption that the municipality will continue the maintenance and management of that borehole.

STICKLER: Are you going to start testing water around those villages and communities that are impacted by your operations?

MORIFI: We will engage the municipality to see if they would like Anglo Platinum to come into partnership with them to test the water in and around the villages around our mines. We have never found contaminants in our water.

STICKLER: Anglo Platinum has now admitted that its tailings dam and the return water dam are leaking water into the underlying aquifers. It does not dispute that there are high levels of nitrates in some of its downstream monitoring points, but asserts that it is highly unlikely that that would migrate towards Ga Molekana. It intends to ask Action Aid to make their data available to ensure that if there are problems these will be attended to as a matter of urgency.

ACTUALITY OF SIREN

STICKLER: Anglo Platinum's operations in Limpopo are expanding and more people are on the move. This is Ga-Puka, another village, another problem.

NOTWANA: Anglo, he know very well, bribe the people to move this site. Because people, they like money. You see, if you are a poor man of a poor wife, the man who got money, he's coming to you and bribe you.

ACTUALITY OF BOOM

NOTWANA: This – ooh.

STICKLER: You can feel the ground shaking.

ACTUALITY OF BOOMS AND BEEPS

STICKLER: Well listen to that. I mean, that's extraordinary isn't it? I mean you could feel the – it set off the alarms in the cars. You can actually feel the ground shaking under your feet, can't you?

NOTWANA: Ah it shake all places, and it is too dangerous because maybe the other houses they are not so good.

STICKLER: Is this why you are sitting outside today, because of the blast?

NOTWANA: Yes.

STICKLER: Because you're worried that during the blast your house may be razed to the ground?

NOTWANA: Yes Sir. You can see now the blast is blasting, but the car is making noise because it is too strong this blast – you see?

STICKLER: Just across the hill in front of James Notwana's house, towering plumes of dust rise into the sky – the result of blasting at the open-cast pit. The relocation started here in June 2007 - and according to Anglo Platinum will be complete by the spring of this year. Despite the dangers, James is holding out - determined to stay in his home.

Why don't you move?

NOTWANA: I can't move here because I'm not happy about the relocation. My grandfather's grave it was there. My father, my wife is already passed, and then my mother is under this mountain, that side. They are still there, and I cannot move them. I've got three children here under this house, because you see the small, small, small children.

STICKLER: You have three children buried here?

NOTWANA: Yes, buried here.

STICKLER: Three of your children are buried here?

NOTWANA: Yes, there are three of them here.

STICKLER: So that's why you want to stay here?

NOTWANA: Yeah, that's why I want to stay here. I can't leave my children here, you see? I won't move, I will stay here until I'm die, because this is my place.

ACTUALITY OF MOVING LORRY

STICKLER: Two hundred yards from James' house a Pickfords removal team awaits instructions from their supervisor. This is a community on the move. Thousands have been resettled already, others are leaving now. Anglo Platinum says it has learnt from previous resettlements. It says it's providing better housing, farmland and an improved financial deal. But this isn't just about compensation, and emotions are running high.

ACTUALITY IN RUBBLE

STICKLER: On the 28th May 2007, members of the community erected a barricade across a road to try and prevent the mine proceeding with the relocation. It was, they say, a peaceful demonstration – then the bulldozers moved in. Sam Ledwaba describes how the police opened fire with rubber bullets.

LEDWABA: It was a peaceful protest, singing our songs and then there comes the police with their bulldozer of the mine. And then we start again stones put again on the road and then the police start shooting. The police start shooting, start shooting, they are shooting our parents, they was shoot, they was shoot. The police are not for the community, the police are working with the people who has mine.

STICKLER: Accounts of what happened next vary, but eye witnesses say seven people were injured. Salome Notoane is 65. She was shot in the face.

NOTOANE: ...

STICKLER: She tells me how she was standing behind a local councillor when the Police opened fire. He ducked. She was hit first in the left hand side of her face, then in her wrist. She describes how she fell to the ground – and fainted. Salome was taken to a local hospital. They removed the rubber bullet from her wrist, but were unable to operate on her face. She waited for three months before being taken to a specialist in Pretoria where the bullet – lodged in her cheek bone - was removed. She is still in pain and says she has lost some of the sight in her left eye. Anglo Platinum paid for her operation, but says it was not responsible for the police opening fire. Mary-Jane Morifi of Anglo Platinum is adamant that there is no discontent and says everyone has signed off on the relocation deal here.

MORIFI: I know we have 100% of the homeowners who have signed up and said we are going to relocate.

STICKLER: Why are there demonstrations then?

MORIFI: I don't know that there are demonstrations . To date we have moved about eight hundred households.

STICKLER: You are not aware of demonstrations at Ga Puka?

MORIFI: Not this week, not last week. I'm not aware of those.

STICKER: Last year?

MORIFI: Those were because one sector of the community wanted to move and another sector did not want them to relocate. The police came in, not at the instructions of Anglo Platinum, and rubber bullets were fired.

STICKLER: It's not going particularly well though, is it? I mean, last year ...

MORIFI: Eight hundred people, households have moved out of 956.

STICKLER: You have people who have told us they don't want to move. Last year you had a demonstration, a 65 year old woman was shot in the face with a rubber bullet. It's not going well, is it?

MORIFI: If you have homeowners who say they do not want to move, we would like to understand what their issues are.

STICKLER: We spoke to one gentleman, a pensioner. He didn't want to leave his home because he had three children buried next to his house. Can you understand why he wouldn't want to go?

MORIFI: I can understand why he would be concerned about his ancestors being left behind, which is why the relocations agreement included the relocation of grave sites.

STICKLER: Digging up the graves?

MORIFI: Yes.

STICKLER: He's got no choice has he, he's got to go?

MORIFI: It is a negotiated settlement. It is part of the relocation agreement that the graves will need to go close to where the community is going to go to.

ACTUALITY OF HEAVY TRUCKS

STICKLER: A seemingly endless column of 220 tonne trucks laden with boulders and rock kick up clouds of dust on the dirt track roads. It takes a ton of ore to produce just one tablespoon of platinum. In 2006, the Potgietersrus mine produced an estimated nine million tonnes of waste – massive rock heaps now sit on one-time farms. Under apartheid these lands were deemed little more than scrub land and were given in trust to so-called tribal authorities. But now they are worth a fortune and whole communities have lost their ancestral home. But they are beginning to fight back, not just with sporadic, ill organised demonstrations, but through the courts. And now international NGOs are joining the fray. Action Aid has just published a hard hitting and controversial report setting out a raft of allegations levelled at Anglo Platinum in Limpopo. Author Mark Curtis has been monitoring the operation of mining companies for the last decade

CURTIS: I think their basic intentions are to make a large amount of money out of platinum in Limpopo province, and they will try and dress up their strategies and policies as very fair to local communities, but really it's exploiting local communities. It's a fundamentally unequal relationship that the company has with communities in the mining areas.

STICKLER: It's very easy to criticise a big mining company. At the end of the day, it's global demand for platinum that is fuelling this, and there are a limited number of places where you can find it. These people would have to be resettled, displaced if we're going to continue down the road of catalytic converters – a greener, cleaner world?

CURTIS: Clearly there is a there's a global need for catalytic converters, but it depends on the terms on which platinum is mined. There has to be fair compensation given to communities who live in the areas where platinum is mined, it can't just be extracted and local communities exploited so that the rest of the world benefits. People need to be given fair amounts of compensation, they need to be asked whether they want to be moved or not in these processes of mining and they should be compensated adequately for that.

STICKLER: This File on 4 investigation into Anglo American's operations has found evidence of contaminated water, violent confrontation and also the fatalities in the mines – around twenty a year. The sign in the lobby of their plush London offices reads: “working towards a vision of zero harm – one injury is one too many.” Edward Bickham is Anglo American's Group Head of External Affairs. If you had twenty people a year dying in the UK in your mines you'd be shut down, wouldn't you?

BICKHAM: Clearly in each country where we operate, there are standards and rules applied by the host government. We apply across the group common standards that operate within Anglo American as well, which are in some cases higher than those of our host government.

STICKLER: Not a record of which you can be proud though?

BICKHAM: Absolutely, and our Chief Executive has said that our levels of fatalities in particular was unacceptable.

STICKLER: Given the fatalities at your mines in South Africa, given the violent confrontations that there have been, the demonstrations, given what's happened with the water, are you happy that your shareholders will be proud of your record in South Africa?

BICKHAM: I think our shareholders are proud of the difference we make across the board. You've raised the issue around water quality. We've absolutely already started looking into this issue, and that if there's a drinking water problem, this is

