

BRITISH BROADCASTING CORPORATION

RADIO 4

TRANSCRIPT OF "FILE ON 4" – "POLICE RACISM"

CURRENT AFFAIRS GROUP

| | | |
|----------------------|---|--------------------|
| <i>TRANSMISSION:</i> | <i>Tuesday 5th June 2012</i> | <i>2000 - 2040</i> |
| <i>REPEAT:</i> | <i>Sunday 10th June 2012</i> | <i>1700 – 1740</i> |

REPORTER: *Allan Urry*

PRODUCER: *Sally Chesworth*

EDITOR: *David Ross*

PROGRAMME NUMBER: *PMR222/12VQ5135*

THE ATTACHED TRANSCRIPT WAS TYPED FROM A RECORDING AND NOT COPIED FROM AN ORIGINAL SCRIPT. BECAUSE OF THE RISK OF MISHEARING AND THE DIFFICULTY IN SOME CASES OF IDENTIFYING INDIVIDUAL SPEAKERS, THE BBC CANNOT VOUCH FOR ITS COMPLETE ACCURACY.

“FILE ON 4”

Transmission: Tuesday 5th June 2012

Repeat: Sunday 10th June 2012

Producer: Sally Chesworth

Reporter: Allan Urry

Editor: David Ross

URRY: Tonight File on 4 investigates race relations in the police. Thirteen years after the Stephen Lawrence inquiry found a service blighted by institutional racism, why are some officers still complaining about the attitude of colleagues?

AHMED: I was attending a robbery call, it was an emergency call, and he contacted me on my radio. He said, ‘Right, when you’ve finished with that, can you get me a bacon butty?’ At first my impression was, have I heard that right, because (a) I’m a Muslim, (b) it was Ramadan so I was fasting. I just found the whole request highly inappropriate.

URRY: But what happens if you complain? We hear allegations that the powerful police disciplinary process turns against you. The programme has seen an internal report which suggests disproportionate numbers of minority officers end up under investigation.

KHAN: If you were to compare my scenario with a white officer’s equivalent, it’s not nice for me to say it, but I feel and believe it was racial discrimination.

URRY: And, with minorities still under-represented in the ranks, we've also discovered more are leaving the service than joining. Why aren't police up to strength with the numbers they need to represent the communities they serve?

SIGNATURE TUNE

ACTUALITY WITH ANTHONY JOSEPH

JOSEPH: I'll show you a photo on my phone. This is me in uniform. I felt very proud that I was putting on the uniform, because the uniform – to me – signified being part of a disciplined force.

URRY: At forty, Anthony Joseph was a bit of a late starter for a police career, but he came with a lot of life experience, having worked in local government community relations. He's a graduate, with a Master's Degree in criminal justice. When he joined the City of London Police in 2009, he did so with a sense of purpose.

JOSEPH: Because of a lot of the negativity surrounding the police, especially with the black community and relations with the black community, I felt going in at that time, I had the necessary skills and aptitude to make a significant contribution. I was willing to work hard and I was willing to do whatever it took.

URRY: His probationary work got off to a very promising start. Within weeks he was being commended for an arrest of a wanted man, who then tried to escape from the custody suite of a police station. The custody manager, a police inspector, was impressed - so much so he wrote a glowing tribute.

READER IN STUDIO: I understand this was your first arrest, and as such you are to be congratulated. It's gratifying to see young officers setting such high standards. Well done.

URRY: But soon after, things started to go wrong. Anthony Joseph describes a mounting sense of isolation as his probationary period progressed. An official complaint was made against him by a colleague for accepting the gift of a small bottle of fizzy drink from a shop where he was attending a robbery. Then he was accused of gross misconduct, a dismissible offence. He was suspected of cheating during academic work for an NVQ police qualification. They said he'd forged the signature of a supervisor responsible for signing off his work.

JOSEPH: There was no wrongdoing on my part, but they decided to go forward with an investigation that lasted three months.

URRY: Three months?

JOSEPH: Absolutely. Three months, whereby I believed at the time this could have taken twenty-four hours just to decipher who had signed it rather than sabotaging the time I had, which was crucial at this point because I was trying to get my NVQ completed. Being accused of being a cheat obviously it was trying to make it appear that I was a person that could not be trusted, and I was also told that I could potentially be sacked, so this caused a great deal of stress upon me at the time.

URRY: It turned out a different police supervisor had signed the work off. Although Mr Joseph had done nothing wrong, he ended up paying the price. He was put on an action plan to manage his performance. By this time he alleges they were trying to manage him out of the service, not keep him in, by setting unfair targets.

JOSEPH: I had to complete seven arrests. I also had to complete seven stop and searches per day.

URRY: Is it standard practice to put a number on the stop and searches that you were asked to do?

JOSEPH: It's not usual practice, but in my case I can only say that this practice was placed before me to make it appear that I could not perform or reach up to the acceptable standard, and it's like being between a rock and a hard place to be able to

JOSEPH cont: complete these action plans and complete stop and searches where you don't have the reasonable grounds to do so.

URRY: He didn't make the targets. The National Black Police Association was brought in. Its President, Charles Critchlow, himself an officer of twenty-two years' experience, reviewed his case with dismay.

CRITCHLOW: That is an inappropriate action plan in our estimation. What would be required is for that trainee to be able to demonstrate that when they've conducted a stop and search, that they've done it in accordance with the legal requirements and that they've done it according to guidelines and they've done it appropriately, but there is no requirement for any officer to conduct any specific number of arrests or stop and search or anything for that matter.

URRY: Did you have a look at his performance record?

CRITCHLOW: I couldn't see anything in the various documentation that I looked at that would suggest to me that this is an officer that you'd want to be getting rid of. I would have thought that this is an officer that you would want to try and develop.

URRY: The Association thought it wasn't too late to salvage the situation. They suggested some of their own resources were put to good use by City of London to help what should have been a trainee with great promise.

CRITCHLOW: We offered them free mentoring. We have got access to mentors who would be of a fairly senior rank and of significant experience in terms of, you know, developing officers. It was bizarre that they never actually considered the offer.

URRY: Did they tell you why?

CRITCHLOW: They didn't even respond.

URRY: Anthony Joseph, the trainee with a Master's Degree in Criminal Justice, commended for setting high standards, was told by the force he wasn't good enough. He left last year, having failed to qualify as a fully-fledged police constable. Two months ago, Mr Joseph began employment tribunal proceedings against the force, alleging racial discrimination. But, facing big legal bills if he lost, he withdrew. No one from City of London Police would be interviewed for this programme, but in a statement we were told:

READER IN STUDIO: The force works very hard to continually improve our approach to equality and diversity, work that was acknowledged recently when we were recognised as the National Association of Muslim Police's force of the year. There is still more the force can achieve in this area, and that continues to be a focus for the senior management team. The allegations made by Mr Joseph are entirely unfounded and it is disappointing he sees fit to raise this issue again, given he formally withdrew the complaints during an employment tribunal he brought in April.

URRY: Might it not be the case that you just weren't a very good police officer at that level?

JOSEPH: Well I disagree, because I feel that I was performing to a good standard. When you're going through probation you will make mistakes – it's part and parcel of your training. The experience that I had, it made me feel that this was totally wrong and it was unfair and unethical that a person be treated in this manner.

URRY: Might it be the case that you're oversensitive about your race then and that you see things in a particular way because of that?

URRY: I would disagree that I'm oversensitive, based on the fact that before I joined, I was well aware of the McPherson Report into institutionalised racism. But I felt as a citizen of the UK, born and bred in Britain, I would be able to make a significant contribution and a positive contribution.

ACTUALITY OF JACK STRAW

STRAW: ... Speaker, the McPherson Inquiry has demonstrated the failings of one very important public institution, the police service.

URRY: Among the McPherson recommendations taken forward by the Blair Government were those aimed at increasing numbers of black and ethnic minority officers.

STRAW: I will set targets for the recruitment, the retention and promotion of ethnic minority police and civilian staff.

URRY: That was seen as vital to help clean up the service, putting an end to institutional racism. But it hasn't happened. To be representative at that time, the service needed around 7% of minority officers. The Office of National Statistics' most recent percentage is 9.5%. But so far, more than a decade on, less than 5% has been achieved. Part of the reason for this is that too many of those, like Anthony Joseph, who join hoping for a career for life, leave early. Almost half who voluntarily resign within two to five years in uniform are from minorities. And it's getting worse. When File on 4 checked the latest Home Office figures, they showed there were more minority officers leaving than joining. In 2010/11, a hundred and sixty-five signed up, but two hundred and four left.

HOLDAWAY: This is something that's a real major concern now. The figures over five years tell us that roughly about half of Asian officers have left, so retention levels after recruitment, you open the front door and for half of them the back door is open and they go.

URRY: Professor Simon Holdaway is a former police officer who's spent most of his academic career as a criminologist studying race relations and the police. He's dismayed by the latest figures.

HOLDAWAY: It almost beggars belief actually, given the history of policy in this area and government attention, that this isn't a matter that the Home Office is investigating, engaging in research about it, regarding it as urgent and Chief Constables themselves of course should within their own constabularies keep a very watchful eye on this

HITCHCOCK: That is a worrying figure, that is a worrying trend, and clearly that is something that we need to get a grip of. There's undoubtedly been a problem most recently because of the cuts which means we're not recruiting people in, but people are continuing to leave the service from all groups, and as they leave the service that of course creates a disproportionate impact.

URRY: Even if the cuts are affecting recruitment now, what about the progress of those who joined some years ago? Superintendent Kul Verma, has twenty-nine years in service. Like the majority of ethnic officers of his rank, he's coming up to retirement. Mr Verma has been conducting research during his time at the National Police Improvement Agency, which highlights a shortfall in the top half of the organisation.

VERMA: If you look at the ACPO rank, the Association of Chief Police Officers, in 2010 there was 3.9%. In 2011 there was 1.3% and that just describes that if you have just three people leave, you'll have a massive dent in the percentage figures.

URRY: That's what's happened, is it? Just three people have left and it's been responsible for that slide in percentage terms?

VERMA: Absolutely. The statistical review of the data, it really describes how small actual numbers of BME officers at senior levels are. So if you look at chief superintendents in 2011, it's 2.9%, superintendents 3.6%. That roughly comes in at round about forty-five superintendents and chief superintendents that were BME backgrounds.

URRY: Across England and Wales?

VERMA: Across England and Wales.

URRY: It doesn't seem that many.

VERMA: It doesn't seem that many at all. If you take chief superintendents and superintendents, there are almost two-thirds that would be heading off towards retirement, so you're looking at a massive dent in those figures. And what you

CRITCHLOW cont: and ultimately force them out of the organisation, and that's something that we're very very concerned about.

URRY: The specific allegation you're making, which is a very serious one, is that police are unfair in the use of their very powerful disciplinary processes, to target and to discipline ethnic minority officers more so than their white counterparts.

CRITCHLOW: Well, I can only tell you what officers are telling me, and consistently, right across, you know, the United Kingdom that's the information that's coming back to the National Black Police Association. That is not to say that all officers are racist or, you know, discriminate against people, but there seems to be a problem in the police service when it comes to dealing with race issues.

URRY: That problem is coming to a head in West Yorkshire. There, minority officers are complaining of discrimination and unfair treatment. Some say it's cost them their career.

ACTUALITY WITH DRIVING INSTRUCTOR

KHAN: I think just the idea of teaching someone to drive and the joys of having success at the end would be rewarding so yeah, that's probably the reason why I decided to do this.

URRY: Talib Khan is a driving instructor in his home town of Halifax.

And what's business like at the moment?

KHAN: Business is okay. Obviously there's a lot of competition so you're always fighting the next instructor

URRY: Mr Khan has always liked cars. He used to be a constable and, during his time with West Yorkshire Police, he bought a few performance vehicles - an interest he says he could afford because he doesn't drink or live in a fancy house. But that didn't go down too well with some of his colleagues.

KHAN: The main investment, car-wise was I bought a convertible Audi, which was nice and most certainly turned some heads, yeah, and got some comments going as well.

URRY: What sort of comments?

KHAN: Well, apart from the obvious, 'Oh, nice car,' I mean, 'How many wraps are you selling today?' you know – ie you know, how much drugs are you dealing. Comments like that you don't expect. Bradford, I mean, it is heavily Asian and there are a lot of youngsters and there's a lot of them that have got some prestige cars, and the phrase by a majority of white officers is, you know, if you see them, it'll be a drug dealer. I mean, a white officer counterpart of mine drives into the car park with a brand new convertible Audi, you're not going to say, 'How many wraps have you sold?' No. Trust me.

URRY: Do you think so? Might they not have?

KHAN: No, no way. It is only because I am a brown face and they put two and two together, you're a drug dealer. You know, you are in a fancy car, you are going to be a drug dealer like everybody else out on the streets.

URRY: Despite the comments of his colleagues, Talib Khan was a cop with a good record - thirteen years in two forces, a Chief Constable's commendation and no disciplinary history. But that was to change. Early one morning in 2009, there was a commotion outside his house.

KHAN: I believe it was approximately 6.30 in the morning, loud banging on the door, four shadows through the glass, obviously didn't know who it was out there.

URRY: Because you've got little windows here, haven't you?

KHAN: Yeah, got windows in there. So I opened my door. When I counted, I'm sure I counted there was ten, ten officers that had come to the house for me, which I found bizarre.

URRY: What sort of operation would usually warrant the attendance of ten police officers?

KHAN: A very serious offender, so you wouldn't come with an army for an officer.

URRY: Talib Khan was arrested for trying to sell counterfeit goods - hair tongs he'd posted for sale within West Yorkshire Police. Mr Khan told us the internal advertisement was placed in good faith on behalf of a cousin.

KHAN: It turned out that the hair straighteners, which obviously I didn't know at the time, they were counterfeit, they weren't the real thing, so when I realised that that was the case obviously the dealings from my part stopped. Obviously it were a case of I had no more involvement with them.

URRY: So you can see why there might be a need for an investigation?

KHAN: Oh, you know, I appreciate, I'd be surprised if they didn't investigate, so I was expecting them to look into it, because I mean if the whole building is talking about you, then somebody needs to do some enquiries.

URRY: But you would have held your hands up?

KHAN: Oh yeah, aye, I mean there is no way that I would say no, I haven't done that. My hands were up straightaway saying that you can sort of punish me in that sense, that I am responsible, but I didn't genuinely do it knowing that they were counterfeit.

URRY: He expected a reprimand, but he was charged with criminal offences relating to selling counterfeit goods. His cousin, who he says was the man with the supplies, wasn't charged with anything. Talib Khan was put on trial in February 2010.

KHAN: It got dealt with in two days in front of a jury, the full case brought out, and at the end the twelve person jury, you know, not guilty, unanimous verdict. Judge, his response at the time was the jury made the correct decision and he released me straightaway and I walked out. I was happy and I was relieved as well, but then thinking what a waste, why have they done this, you know? I can't truly imagine that they expected something different.

URRY: But his force didn't need the outcome of the court case to decide his fate. They'd already sacked him for gross misconduct, using internal disciplinary procedures, before it came to trial. Deputy Chief Constable John Parkinson stands by that decision.

Why have you kicked a guy out for advertising some hair tongs that turned out to be counterfeit?

PARKINSON: Well let me put it this way, he is a serving police officer who openly advertises for sale counterfeit fake goods, some of which are potentially dangerous. We are talking about some hair straighteners, some of which started to smoke and could have caused untold damage or injury to people, was openly selling them, saying that he could get numerous quantities of them for people. That feels to me to be entirely dishonest and I don't think ...

URRY: He puts his hands up, he just says, 'Look, I didn't know there was a problem with these things.' He puts his hand up to that, at which point should he not have been told off, given a written warning and told just to be more careful next time?

PARKINSON: I think the public expect more of police officers. This man is trained, he knows the law, there is no question in my view that somebody who tries to trade in counterfeit or fake goods can claim that he didn't think there was anything wrong. I think that is a farcical position and I think

URRY: Well it wasn't farcical for a jury that threw the case out.

PARKINSON: Well because the jury needs to hear things beyond all reasonable doubt and is dealing with it against a criminal charge. The criminal charge is in relation to the trading of counterfeit goods. The internal matter is one of was his conduct discreditable and was his honesty and integrity intact, and the answer to both those question by the panel was no and therefore he was dismissed - and quite rightly so.

URRY: Thirteen years with an unblemished record and a Chief Constable's commendation. An Asian man patrolling his own community. Fantastic.

PARKINSON: And that's very laudable and so it's a shame, a real shame and a real tragedy that he couldn't have continued in that career.

URRY: Talib Khan says he can't work out what was so gross about his misconduct. He argues as an Asian man he was stereotyped in service and believes that played a role in the way he was treated. He alleges he would have been shown more leniency if he were white. West Yorkshire Police deny any racial discrimination or unfair treatment, but he's not the only one making those allegations.

ACTUALITY OF BRADFORD RIOT

URRY: 2001. Riots were exploding in Bradford and the police were in the firing line. An Asian man was out on the streets, trying to protect the thin blue line.

AHMED: What I witnessed on that night was horrendous. I risked both my life and my limb to stand in front of the police to stop the rioters throwing stones, bricks, petrol bombs, and myself and some other people from the community, we sort of joined hands and formed a human chain and we were trying to discourage the rioters from throwing stones. If they saw us, we were civilians and they would then be dissuaded from throwing. My heart went out to those officers serving on that, on that evening.

URRY: It was then Kashif Ahmed says he made up his mind to become a police officer. Equipped with a law degree and a determination to make a difference to his own community, he joined West Yorkshire, first as a community support

AHMED: With it being a small car park, there was always limited room, so it wasn't in a designated bay, but as far as I was aware it wasn't causing an obstruction to any other car. People could get in, could get out. I mean, there was cars parked in worse positions than my vehicle was. The issue was that my colleague moved it into a parking bay, he was told it's not going to be towed. Half an hour after, it was towed away from a designated bay. In contrast, you have white colleagues who received email warnings saying, 'Don't park your car in these positions or we'll remove them.' I didn't receive any such warnings.

URRY: Kashif Ahmed had had enough. He raised a formal complaint with the force's Professional Standards Department, responsible for internal discipline and investigations. He felt he was being bullied and persecuted. Matters quickly escalated, but not in the way he anticipated. He discovered he was under investigation. The facts of his case are long, complex and hotly disputed by both sides. What isn't in doubt is the extraordinary lengths to which West Yorkshire Police went as they probed into his personal life and financial affairs.

AHMED: So I was arrested seventeen times and interviewed nineteen times, I believe in total, and the investigation lasted three years. Now when I had meetings with my federation representative, he had not seen or heard of a case like mine and he was completely outraged, he was like, he could not rationalise it, and he was saying, 'They must think you're part of Al-Qaeda, the way that they're going after you.' So I believe instead of them dealing with this effectively, they were thinking, right, you know, we need to come down like a sledgehammer approach now because the way that I've sort of seen the police service respond to allegations of racism is they'll try to discredit you. They'll deny it, and the way they will process that complaint is by discrediting you.

URRY: West Yorkshire Police deny any attempt to discredit. PC Ahmed was charged with criminal offences relating to the mis-declaring of a mortgage application and other loans. He denied them. No terrorism or other serious criminal matters were put before him. Then, last year, following an application to the courts by his defence team, the case was thrown out because of abuse of process. Kashif Ahmed had been investigated by West Yorkshire's homicide and major enquiry team, its economic crime unit,

URRY cont: its counterterrorism branch, and its asset recovery department. But it wasn't the end of the matter. After the courts threw the case out, he came under the scrutiny of the force's major investigation review team for a further eight months. In November last year, he resigned. For West Yorkshire Police, Deputy Chief Constable John Parkinson says if he hadn't walked out, he would have faced disciplinary proceedings in due course.

PARKINSON: Over a three year period, a number of issues arose that brought into question his honesty and integrity, and we did a painstaking investigation - as I think the public would expect us to - to get to the bottom of that. The Crown Prosecution Service independently assessed the evidence that we had amassed, supported that he be charged and face the criminal courts. Ultimately he was charged with a number of offences against a breach of the police code of conduct, which is enshrined in police regulations and he left the organisation, and frankly I think that is appropriate for somebody whose honesty and integrity was in doubt.

URRY: He was arrested seventeen times, interviewed nineteen times, held for thirty-five hours. He's been treated as though he's some kind of major league criminal.

PARKINSON: No, he has been treated in accordance with the manner in which we can investigate these matters.

URRY: Isn't it the case that effectively the force was trying to discredit him once he had brought complaints, because there were damning allegations in those complaints, including racial discrimination?

PARKINSON: Yes he did make those complaints but frankly I think that was a smoke screen around his own actions.

URRY: So did you find any substance in his allegation that he was being racially discriminated against?

PARKINSON: No.

URRY: So when an officer says that he looks like a terrorist because he's carrying a rucksack and white police officers who overhear that – not him, white police officers - then complain about that, you don't think that is racial discrimination?

PARKINSON: No, that is not something that he has particularly raised back with the force. We have asked ...

URRY: No, he hasn't, other officers have, because they were shocked by that.

PARKINSON: We have asked Mr Ahmed to supply us on repeated occasions with any particulars or any information or evidence that he has that would support any of his allegations, and he has continually refused to supply any particular information about it other than generalised statements.

URRY: Now, Kashif Ahmed has lodged an employment tribunal case, alleging racial discrimination. Local campaigners who back him say they've spoken to a dozen other West Yorkshire police officers and staff, who are also complaining about racism and discrimination. The force says it's examining those concerns.

PARKINSON: I accept there have been a number of cases. I don't accept that there's been any institutional or other kinds of racism that's affected the decisions. Just to bring this into some kind of context, we've had nearly a hundred and ninety disciplinary panel cases over the last three years, ranging from very minor matters to much more complex and serious matters like the ones that have been involved in this case, and from that three members of the BME background have been dismissed. So I think the context is really important. Nevertheless, we haven't rested on those laurels and we have worked very closely with the Police Authority to scrutinise this, to speak with individuals, to deal with case studies and we've put an action plan together about how we can try and improve some of this perceived challenges that we have around proportionality and the way that we deal with investigations, particularly those involving members of BME staff.

URRY: The vexed question of whether police disciplinary machinery is being used disproportionately against its own serving minorities has begun to trouble other forces. Greater Manchester has commissioned research into the matter. West Yorkshire were invited to contribute, but declined. Two other forces, West Midlands and British Transport Police, submitted data. It's not yet been published, but File on 4 has seen a draft. It acknowledges the concerns raised by staff associations about the perceptions of unfair treatment.

READER IN STUDIO: Investigated BME officers and representatives strongly expressed the view that disproportionality is apparent in the conduct of investigations and the anxiety and distress caused. It has not been possible to confirm. This is perception which needs to be addressed along with other concerns.

URRY: What researchers did confirm was that in the West Midlands, BME officers were almost twice as likely to be the subject of an investigation compared to white officers. Findings for British Transport Police were broadly similar. The study also looked at who is being kept under surveillance in internal counter corruption investigations. In Greater Manchester the chances of being investigated were said to be three times greater. In the West Midlands, the rate of allegations of corruption were more than five times higher. In calling for further research, the authors state findings:

READER IN STUDIO: ... suggest the problems identified in this report are not limited to the three services.

URRY: And that's a conclusion which troubles the Association of Chief Police Officers. Alfred Hitchcock speaks for the Association on Equality and Diversity. Because the report is in draft form, Mr Hitchcock hadn't yet been given a copy.

HITCHCOCK: I will be really interested in seeing it, because if there is an impact there then we need to get to the bottom of why that is happening. Traditionally the argument has been that people are more cautious, because it is a minority officer they are wanting to make sure that they get the process right, and by simply doing that there is the potential for creating a disproportionate impact. But I guess, you know, you have got to look

HITCHCOCK cont: at the numerics of whether these are statistically significant, because we are talking about very low numbers of officers and very low numbers of complaints.

URRY: Yes, but if proportionately more people are being put through the system from ethnic minority backgrounds than are from white backgrounds, that certainly gives ethnic minority officers a reason to suppose that they are being treated unfairly.

HITCHCOCK: That would undoubtedly influence your perception of unfair treatment, but what you would have to do is know what the cases were and actually be able to drill into why they have occurred. But what I would say is that the service is very very keen to make sure that we deal properly and appropriately with all staff, and by doing that we would see that people see us as being fair with all, and that is the objective.

URRY: Mr Hitchcock says he'll be speaking with other Chief Constables about the issue of internal discipline and concerns about misuse. The evidence we've heard in this programme suggests there are still deep rooted problems which the service needs to address. There are worrying signs that the difficulties of recruiting, retaining and promoting black and ethnic minority officers are deepening. The police leadership acknowledge there's still some way to go to put their house in order.

HITCHCOCK: If some people think we have got this sorted, I think they are living in a dream world. I think there is an awful lot of work for us still to do. There is a danger that we put an over negative spin on where we've come in the last decade, because actually we've made fantastic progress. But that doesn't mean we stop. That means we actually need to renew and re-energise. If the data and these perceptions are saying that there is a problem, then that needs to be addressed.

SIGNATURE TUNE